

Technical Reviewers' Rating Summary

Proposal Number Application Title Submitted By
 Request For Total Project Costs

Section A. Scoring

Statement	Weighting Factor	G-52-03A	G-52-03B	G-52-03C	Average Weighted Score
1. Objectives	9	5	4	4	36
2. Achievability	7	5	4	5	28
3. Methodology	8	4	4	2	24
4. Contribution	8	5	3	3	24
5. Awareness / Background	5	4	4	4	20
6. Project Management	3	4	4	4	12
7. Equipment / Facilities	2	5	4	4	8
8. Value / Industry - Budget	4	5	5	4	16
9. Financial Match - Budget	4	5	3	5	16
Average Weighted Score		234	192	187	204
Total: 50					250 possible points

OVERALL RECOMMENDATION

FUND	X	X	X
FUNDING TO BE CONSIDERED			
DO NOT FUND			

Section B. Ratings and Comments

- The objectives or goals of the proposed project with respect to clarity and consistency with North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals are:

The proposed activity will focus on educating ND residents on the oil and gas industry which is a goal of the NDIC/Oil and Gas Research Council.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 5

The applicant's objectives are very clearly aligned with the following OGRP statutory goals and purposes: "Promote Public Awareness of the benefits and opportunities provided by the North Dakota oil and gas industry."

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 4

It's good to see ND Petroleum Foundation taking a continuing run at this, and I compliment NDPC on the decision to identify the program with the Foundation. The Energy of North Dakota campaign, despite its oil-focused content, I felt lost the connection to the petroleum industry. Producers, and the service companies and others who support the petroleum

industry, should be forcefully proud of their work and their enormous economic contribution to the state and nation, and likewise let the people of North Dakota and the world know it.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 4

2. With the approach suggested and time and budget available, the objectives are:

Based on their work in the past it on the education program I assume that they are well positioned to estimate the cost to achieve the stated goals of the activity. I concur with their estimate.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 5

The application is largely a continuation of work performed under the Energy of North Dakota brand. Given past experience on the scope of work, there does not appear to be any concern with the proposed budget and timelines.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 4

NDPC and the Foundation can certainly accomplish the tasks laid out through outreach, cookfests, public education sessions, pick up the patch, traffic safety, etc. This reviewer, however, would like to see more outreach events in eastern North Dakota. Target UND and NDSU students to demonstrate the values and merits of oil industry occupations. Coordinate with Grand Forks and Fargo Chambers to target business leaders in the RR Valley. Many in the east do not understand nor appreciate the oil industry contribution to the ND economy.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 5

Reviewer: G-52-03C, thank you for your comment. It is actually part of our plan to more specifically target the eastern part of ND. We agree that our industry might not be as connected or understood and we want to change that.

- Applicant

3. The quality of the methodology displayed in the proposal is:

The methodology displayed builds on the past very successful program operated by the oil and gas council that is now situated in the oil and gas foundation. This methodology was successful in the past and should be successful in the future in achieving the programs goals.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 4

With a history of success in public outreach and engagement, a continuation of past strategies and programs seems most appropriate. Applicant outlines their plan to refresh industry information when necessary.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 4

The intent of the program is good, but its execution has been less than exemplary. The last Tweet from @EnergyofND was May 19, yet the application touts a "consistent social media ... campaign." The content also needs to be more bold, and less "fluff." Its primary function is public education and industry promotion, but there are times when the Foundation must delve into industry politics. There has been no mention of the DAPL pipeline shutdown fight by Energy of ND on Twitter. Nothing about TENORM and its disposal in Montana. Far too often, the association and industry are slow to engage on important issues, thus allowing opposing views to determine public perception. Energy of ND on Facebook has generated a

stronger following, but again no posts to engage the public on important policy issues. Both social media platforms are missing opportunities to educate the public on environmental, political and economic realities.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 2

4. The scientific and/or technical contribution of the proposed work to specifically address North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals will likely be:

the program focuses on the continuation of past successful activities to maintain/enhance the favorable opinions by ND of the oil and gas industry. This is one of the goals of the NDIC/Oil and Gas Research Council. As such the activity will be a major contributor to meeting those goals.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 5

While not directly a technical/research based proposal, the efforts to raise the public and educator understanding of the petroleum industry shouldn't be diminished.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 3

Many North Dakotans appreciate what the "shale revolution" represents. It's an absolute marvel of technology to extract millions of barrels of oil from tight shale formations two miles underground. Completion and extraction is certainly part of the education materials, but I would like to see even more promotion of this energy miracle. Forty years ago the public believed we were running out of oil. Now we have too much thanks to horizontal drilling and fracking. Yet far, far too many fail to appreciate "cheap oil." The Foundation's message should include Gov. Burgum's theme. It starts with gratitude.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 3

5. The background of the principal investigator and the awareness of current research activity and published literature as evidenced by literature referenced and its interpretation and by the reference to unpublished research related to the proposal is:

The past success using the principal investigator and the staff of the oil and Gas council should result in a successful program.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 4

The NDPF team, as well as partnering stakeholders, appear to have more than adequate qualifications to performed the proposed scope of work.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 4

I believe the investigators are prepared to respond to ongoing technological developments, and incorporate new information into the Foundation's campaign. It's good to tout EERC's efforts, particularly the iPIPE program and OGRC's support. What a fantastic example of a pro-active industry response to a serious problem. Leak detection and prevention efforts should be a significant component of the public education campaign.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 4

6. The project management plan, including a well-defined milestone chart, schedule, financial plan, and plan for communications among the investigators and subcontractors, if any, is:

The budget and management plan are appropriate for this proposed activity and should result in a successful activity.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 4

With past experiences for guidance, the proposed management plan appears to be adequate to execute the scope of work.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 4

With its existing track record, events and outreach look to be well-organized and coordinated with industry and community partners. As previously noted, the Foundation should consider opportunities for additional outreach and education in eastern ND. As social media evolves and new platforms emerge, it is hoped the investigators would seek opportunities to reach a broader audience, particularly the younger generation.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 4

7. The proposed purchase of equipment and the facilities available is:

No equipment is listed as needed in the proposal

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 5

The expenses related to the proposed outreach efforts appear to be well justified by the applicant. Past experiences will likely help the applicant fine tune what types of expenditures provide the most benefit to support the OGRP goals.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 4

It is gratifying to see NDPC developing and hiring in-house expertise, rather than what can sometimes be over-priced services of large ad agencies. It is unclear from the application whether the Foundation has established advisory committees or focus groups to develop messaging, but it would be worth considering.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 4

8. The proposed budget "value" relative to the outlined work and the commitment from other sources is of:

It is critically important that the residents of ND are educated on the benefits and impacts of the oil and gas industry. This industry is critical to North Dakota and for it to continue to thrive in ND the citizens of the state must know and understand how it operates and the benefits that result for the state and its residents.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 5

The application's value appears to be very high due to the strong partnership support from participating companies and public sector organizations.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 5

It is absolutely essential that the petroleum industry be engaged in public education efforts because it's certain anti-fossil fuel groups will continue to be well-funded, highly aggressive, and unfortunately achieving greater influence over public opinion. The Foundation likewise needs to think aggressively, and actively engage the opposition to refute the disinformation

about the industry that has become increasingly common.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 4

9. The “financial commitment”² from other sources in terms of “match funding” have been identified:

The required matching funds have been identified.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

- Rating: 5

The financial commitment from matching sources appears to be comparable to most OGRP applications with a 50/50 split.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

- Rating: 3

The 50-50 match is traditionally appropriate, but the importance of the considerable in-kind contribution of NDPC staff, its partners and its individual members cannot be understated, and make this application an outstanding value for OGRC.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C

- Rating: 5

1 “value” – The value of the projected work and technical outcome for the budgeted amount of the project, based on your estimate of what the work might cost in research settings with which you are familiar. A commitment of support from industry partners equates to a higher value.

2 “financial commitment” from other sources – A minimum of 50% of the total project must come from other sources to meet the program guidelines. Support less than 50% from Industrial Commission sources should be evaluated as favorable to the application; industry partnerships equates to increased favorability.

General Comments

The oil and gas industry is a major contributor to the quality of life enjoyed in North Dakota. The citizens of ND need to understand the impacts of that industry for its continues success. In particular the environmental impacts must be accepted or groups that want to see no development can influence political decisions that will have a negative impact on ND. The industry must continue to help educate the citizens on ND to understand the true benefits and impacts of the industry for it to continue to thrive in the state.

- Reviewer: G-52-03A

A recommendation to "fund" the proposed scope of work is appropriate given the direct connection to the following OGRP statutory goal and purpose: "Promote Public Awareness of the benefits and opportunities provided by the North Dakota oil and gas industry." Further supporting the recommendation to fund, the application meets the following OGRP criteria for priority status: "Most effectively educate the general public about the benefits and opportunities provided by the North Dakota oil and gas industry." If funded, the applicant's scope of work will support the petroleum industries efforts to maintain its "social license to operate". This public trust and acceptance is built slowly and needs to be continually fostered to ensure North Dakota's petroleum industry can continue to thrive.

- Reviewer: G-52-03B

This reviewer's personal prejudice is evident in the comments. The oil and gas industry, and the fossil fuel industry in general, have been far too timid in their response to attacks from the environmental left. The proposal includes many of the industry feel-good events and programs that generate tremendous goodwill. But a public education proposal such as this should also recognize that the industry is in a war for its survival. Far too many citizens fail to appreciate just how

essential oil and gas, and the infrastructure needed to deliver them, are to modern society. It would be gratifying to see the Foundation campaign consider "countermeasures" to overcome myths, misinformation and the anti-fossil fuel mentality that seem to be so in vogue today.

- Reviewer: G-52-03C