

# Technical Reviewers' Rating Summary

Proposal Number  Application Title  Submitted By  
 Request For  Total Project Costs

## Section A. Scoring

Statement	Weighting Factor	G-57-01A	G-57-01B	G-57-01C	Average Weighted Score
1. Objectives	9	4	4	4	36
2. Achievability	4	4	4	5	16
3. Performance Measurement	5	4	4	3	15
4. Methodology	8	5	4	4	32
5. Contribution	8	5	2	4	24
6. Awareness / Background	5	5	5	4	20
7. Project Management	3	4	4	3	9
8. Equipment / Facilities	2	4	4	3	6
9. Value / Industry - Budget	3	4	4	4	12
10. Financial Match - Budget	3	3	3	4	9
<b>Average Weighted Score</b>		<b>218</b>	<b>186</b>	<b>194</b>	<b>199</b>
	Total: 50				<b>250 possible points</b>

## OVERALL RECOMMENDATION

FUND  X  X  X  
 FUNDING TO BE CONSIDERED   
 DO NOT FUND

## Section B. Ratings and Comments

- The objectives or goals of the proposed project with respect to clarity and consistency with North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals are:

The objectives of NDPF's Outreach and Education Program are very consistent with many of the OGRP goals and purposes. The proposal objectives align particularly well with the following stated goals: -Promote Public Awareness of the benefits and opportunities provided by the North Dakota oil and gas industry. -Most effectively educate the general public about the benefits and opportunities provided by the North Dakota oil and gas industry. -Generate information and knowledge that will have the highest probability of bringing new oil and gas companies and industry investment to North Dakota.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A  
 - Rating: 4

The NDIC OGRC grant funding requirements of education and outreach to the public and students of North Dakota align perfectly with the goals of the ND Petroleum Foundation's Education and Outreach Program. The proposed program is an extension and expansion of an

already proven program administered previously by the NDPC for over a decade.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

- Rating: 4

The objectives and goals of this project is the continuation of a successful program and the details provided in the application clearly shows how the project is consistent with the goals of the North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 4

2. With the approach suggested and time and budget available, the objectives are:

The proposed approach, timeline, and budget all appear reasonable to accomplish the stated objectives. The NDPC/NDPF have had tremendous success with their past programs and I have no reason at this time to believe the current proposal will struggle to meet the objectives. Given that this application is largely a continuation of an existing program previously funded by the OGRP, it can be reasonably assumed that a number of program efficiencies will carry over into the next phase.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A

- Rating: 4

The proposed Education and Outreach program has been largely implemented successfully for over a decade by the NDPC and will continue with the ND Petroleum foundation. The budget is likely adequate by benefitting from the long history of the basic elements of the new proposal and the beneficial and enduring partnerships developed with the energy industry and education entities in North Dakota.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

- Rating: 4

The programs that have been presented have a track record of success and would expect that success to continue.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 5

3. A method for a measurement of success has been clearly defined:

The techniques outlined to measure success are well defined and should provide reliable insight into overall effectiveness of the various programs. We know public perception of the industry can rapidly change and I think the tools being deployed will be able to quickly identify key issues for tailoring specific information.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A

- Rating: 4

A history of statewide surveys to determine the perception of the energy industry within ND has shown that efforts to reach out to the public appears to have been successful by an overwhelmingly positive result. Continuing these statewide surveys, along with the proposed use of technology available in social media, search engines, and internet survey services, will provide even more feedback on how the program is progressing

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

- Rating: 4

The measurement of success is difficult to measure for this program; however, the objectives and deliverables of the past program were executed effectively and have produced positive comments from the public and the program has received requests for future events to be held in their communities.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 3

4. The quality of the methodology displayed in the proposal is:

Given past success of the applicant, the various methods in which the programs are being managed and deployed should be considered effective and of high quality. I saw no major omissions and have no concerns with the methodology as proposed. The team outlined in application should be capable of effectively implementing all aspects of the proposal.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A

- Rating: 5

The continuation of an industry award winning program is sufficient to judge the quality of the methodology above average.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

- Rating: 4

The proposed use of the funding follows a very successful past program and the methodologies have been proposed in the application.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 4

5. The educational scientific and/or technical and/or economic contribution of the proposed work to specifically address North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals will likely be:

If North Dakota is to continue as a dominant oil and gas producer, a strong local public perception should never be taken for granted. Thus far, as evidenced by the applicant's past survey results, the industry has maintained a favorable view from the general public. An effective outreach effort by the applicant remains just as important today as issues and attitudes can change rapidly.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A

- Rating: 5

While no significant scientific or technological advances are anticipated from the program, educating and informing the public on the positive aspects of the industry in North Dakota will certainly make energy industry operations more acceptable and lead to greater economic progress.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

- Rating: 2

The economic contribution as outlined in the application fits with the objectives of the North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council to facilitate the education of the North Dakota citizens about the significant economic value that the oil and gas industry brings to the State of North Dakota.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 4

6. The background of the principal investigator, and the awareness of current educational activity, and involvement of industry partners of the published literature as evidenced by referenced literature related to the proposal is:

Given the success of similar past efforts, it can be reasonably assumed that the NDPF team and private/public partners are the best fit for the outlined work. It could be strongly argued that there is likely no better combination of private and public participants to lead this type of effort in North Dakota.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A
- Rating: 5

The investigator and others involved within this proposed program have demonstrated a long history of implementing the various parts of the program, documented by several successful events. Social media, newspapers, television, radio, etc., have all participated in documenting the success.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B
- Rating: 5

There is significant support for this program from numerous sources that are associated with the Oil and Gas Industry, as well as organizations that are not typically connected to the Oil and Gas Industry, but this program has brought those groups on board, and they strongly support the program.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C
- Rating: 4

7. The project management plan, including a well-defined milestone chart, schedule, financial plan, and plan for communications among the investigators and subcontractors, if any, is:

The proposed schedule and financial outline appear very appropriate for continuation of the various outreach events and programs. There appears to be no reason to be concerned about the applicant's management plan. I suggest the OGRC members consider past experiences with the applicant as a success guide as it relates to timelines, budgets, and OGRP communication.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A
- Rating: 4

The schedule is a continuation of a program with a very long history that has been refined and improved over time.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B
- Rating: 4

The financial plan and the project objectives are clearly presented and based on the past performance of this program, there is sufficient confidence that the proposed program will be successful.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C
- Rating: 3

8. The proposed materials and media to be developed or used are:

The proposed digital and physical media being developed and updated are very appropriate for the application objectives. The social media marketing appears to be taking a nimble approach and taking advantage of the various targeting and feedback options available. The educational components are equally as important for educators to quickly create meaningful exposure to students and peers.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A
- Rating: 4

Materials and media have been found to be very effective for the outreach and education goals of the program.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B
- Rating: 4

The development of educational materials for use as part of the public outreach is clearly presented and is a key objective and priority of this proposal.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 3

9. The proposed budget “value”<sup>1</sup> relative to the outlined work and the financial commitment from other sources is of:

With a continued high level of industry participation and support, it appears that the state and industry will receive very good value for the funds expended. Comparable past efforts by the NDPF/NDPC appear to have been of high value for all stakeholders. I have no reason to believe that the continuation and expansion will not yield similar benefits.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A

- Rating: 4

Results of past program have been impressive and there is no reason to expect that the future results will be any less outstanding. This program sets the bar for excellence around the industry, nationwide.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

- Rating: 4

Key stakeholders have made significant financial and resource commitments over the years to ensure the success of this program. As outlined in the application, the financial and recourse commitments will continue on with this program.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 4

10. The “financial commitment”<sup>2</sup> from other sources in terms of “match funding” have been identified:

Before the application addendum, it appears the applicant’s matching funds are on the threshold to meet the minimum program requirements. After the proposed addendum, the applicant’s matching funds slightly exceed program minimums.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A

- Rating: 3

Much of the matching funds are in kind, but past history has shown this to be reliable. A number of large contributions from partners and other sponsors are impressive.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

- Rating: 3

Partners from across and outside the Oil and Gas industry see the value of the past program successes and continue to make the same commitments to the future success of the program.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C

- Rating: 4

<sup>1</sup> “value” – The value of the projected work and technical outcome for the budgeted amount of the project, based on your estimate of what the work might cost in research settings with which you are familiar. A commitment of support from industry partners equates to a higher value.

<sup>2</sup> “financial commitment” from other sources – A minimum of 50% of the total project must come from other sources to meet the program guidelines. Support less than 50% from Industrial Commission sources should be evaluated as favorable to the application; industry partnerships equates to increased favorability.

## General Comments

While difficult to define, a “social license to operate” is absolutely necessary for North Dakota’s petroleum industry to remain healthy and vibrant. The general public has little tolerance for industry incidents (or the perceived threat thereof) and the state was wise to prioritize education through

programs like the OGRP. A well planned and multifaceted outreach program is necessary in today's world where misinformation spreads very quickly. I recommend proceeding with funding the grant application as an important step to keeping North Dakota a national and global leader in the petroleum development sector. A continuation of the program is highly likely to continue yielding very positive results towards meeting several of the objectives of the OGRP.

- Reviewer: G-57-01A

The is a very worthwhile program proposal and should be funded to continue the progress that has been made to inform the public in North Dakota and educate our youth on the positive aspects of the energy industry.

- Reviewer: G-57-01B

The North Dakota Petroleum Foundation Outreach and Education Program has strong support from entities from inside and outside the Oil and Gas industry and the continuation of this program is aligned with the key objectives of the North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Councilial education program objectives.

- Reviewer: G-57-01C