

Technical Reviewers' Rating Summary

Proposal Number Application Title Submitted By
 Request For Total Project Costs

Section A. Scoring

Statement	Weighting Factor	G-47-01A	G-47-01B	G-47-01C	Average Weighted Score
1. Objectives	9	4	4	3	27
2. Achievability	7	5	4	5	28
3. Methodology	8	4	4	3	24
4. Contribution	8	3	4	4	24
5. Awareness / Background	5	3	4	3	15
6. Project Management	3	4	4	2	9
7. Equipment / Facilities	2	3	4	3	6
8. Value / Industry - Budget	4	3	4	4	12
9. Financial Match - Budget	4	3	4	4	12
Average Weighted Score		184	200	177	187

Total: 50

250 possible points

OVERALL RECOMMENDATION

FUND	X	X	X
FUNDING TO BE CONSIDERED			
DO NOT FUND			

Section B. Ratings and Comments

- The objectives or goals of the proposed project with respect to clarity and consistency with North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals are:

The project effectively meets the Council's goal of educating about the oil and gas industry.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

- Rating: 4

The proposal lays out the objectives very clearly.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

- Rating: 4

Primarily, this application, as stated, will focus on one of the five goals outlined under the Mission Statement for the Oil and Gas Research Council. It is likely the project will encompass more than one of the five goals however, research and education are the stated focal points for the project.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C

- Rating: 3

- With the approach suggested and time and budget available, the objectives are:

The applications speaks mostly of a one-year time frame which would be an aggressive schedule for all that needs to be accomplished, but as the overall application is for a three-year timeframe, it is highly achievable.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

- Rating: 5

I see no reason why the objectives cannot be met. The proposal includes a timeline and budget that should be achievable.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

- Rating: 4

There's no question if the project is primarily focused on online content, it will be easy to measure activity and to some degree, engagement. What won't be as easy is to determine action. For example, is it important to know if one of the key stakeholder groups, students, are only watching the content that is developed via this project, or do you want to know how many students are choosing careers in oil and gas? That is far more fuzzy.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C

- Rating: 5

The project is a total of three years with the deliverables expected to be minimum of 52 podcasts and/or longer (1,200 words) written historical accounts of the industry per year, or about one per week. We expect to also produce at least 12 mini-docs (1-2 minutes each) per year. Although this seems aggressive, we believe it is achievable once we are able to dig into materials. This timeline may be more difficult in the first year considering research will still be ongoing throughout the first few months of 2019 and it is preferred that interviews take place during the spring or summer so we can go in the field with interviewees if their story warrants it. There are, however, existing on-camera interviews that may be used to also help generate this content if the OGRC wishes to see us remain on a strict timeline. In terms of measuring reach to students this would be more difficult, but online platforms, such as Facebook, do allow you to see the demographics of viewers, which can help determine whether or not it is reaching them and what topics appeal most to them. It would be very difficult to determine if the videos are encouraging students to take an interest in the career in the industry, but this is a challenge that the industry faces as a whole. This project, however, will merely serve as a tool for them to become more informed of the career paths available in the industry and is not the primary goal of the project, which is to record and capture the industry's history as seen from the eyes of its pioneers and leaders.

- Applicant

3. The quality of the methodology displayed in the proposal is:

The methodology gives good thought not only to content generation, but to the quality and distribution of the content. Thought is given to multiple-distribution points and ensuring the effort has long-term value in multiple formats. It provides a good vision for creating statewide value across multiple touch points - educational, historical, inspirational, perception changing, etc.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

- Rating: 4

Since this is the only one I have reviewed, I have nothing to compare it to. But the proposal lays out a methodology that seems to be sound, achievable, and one that can be assessed easily.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

- Rating: 4

Limited methodology is provided.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C

- Rating: 3

The principal investigator, Tessa Sandstrom, will begin background research on the industry using State Archive records and other available resources. This information will be used to help generate reoccurring themes and obtain the necessary background information needed to have informed and thought-provoking conversations with interviewees. This research may take up to two months, upon which introductory conversations with potential interviewees will follow. These introductory interviews will help the interviewer and interviewee become better acquainted and comfortable with one another and also help the interviewer get leads additional information that may further enhance the interview and research. A second round of interviews will follow and be professionally recorded for posterity, as well as for the creation of mini-documentaries and the possibility of creating a full documentary upon the completion of the project. After content is created, they will be posted online, on social media and shared via newsletters and the Talking Points app. The above-outlined process will continue throughout the duration of the project.

- Applicant

4. The scientific and/or technical contribution of the proposed work to specifically address North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals will likely be:

While this project doesn't have a direct research contribution, its efforts will work to document historical achievements in these areas and highlight future potential contributions. It is work that could have impacts in inspiring future innovators towards achievements in the industry.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

- Rating: 3

Historical background and context are always important in any field. Preserving first person or "primary source" material from those involved in the early development of the oil industry in North Dakota will be very significant/

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

- Rating: 4

The project's aim to capture the history of the oil and gas industry in North Dakota via storytelling is a compelling one. It also honors the legends of the industry, and it helps build a more permanent record of the advances the industry has experienced over the years.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C

- Rating: 4

This research will aid in the OGRC's mission to "encourage and promote [...] educational activities concerning the oil and natural gas exploration and production industry." There have been many documentaries and investigative pieces produced about oil and gas development in North Dakota, but unfortunately, the majority of them are focused on the social impacts that are often associated with oil and gas, including crime, infrastructure impacts, and sensational stories. There is very little (if any) content that highlights the technological advances achieved by the industry and its pioneers and the contributions that have resulted thereof. This is a story worth telling and is vital to preserving a balanced and compelling record of this momentous era of North Dakota's history.

- Applicant

5. The background of the principal investigator and the awareness of current research activity and published literature as evidenced by literature referenced and its interpretation and by the reference to unpublished research related to the proposal is:

The principal investigator clearly has good knowledge of how to pull together a project of this nature and understands the industry research needed to capture the historical significance.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

- Rating: 3

There is little reference to any published material or unpublished research because this will be a virtually pioneering effort. Very little has been done to record the history of the oil industry in North Dakota through the experiences of people involved in it.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

- Rating: 4

The principal investigator appears to have a better-than-average knowledge of the resources available through the State Historical Society. There is little reference to published literature or unpublished research outside of mentioning the state historical archives. Perhaps this is the only valid, documented resource for this project. It is also helpful the principal investigator has spent the last six years working for the North Dakota Petroleum Council.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C

- Rating: 3

There is certainly a shortage of information as it has been seen through the eyes of its pioneers. Unfortunately, many of them are passing, leaving their stories untold, which has deprived the state and future industry leaders of their experience and lessons learned. This project aims to capture that history and preserve it for future generations, which is a mission that the principal investigator is extremely passionate about.

- Applicant

6. The project management plan, including a well-defined milestone chart, schedule, financial plan, and plan for communications among the investigators and subcontractors, if any, is:

While a project plan was included and mentioned some product elements and partnerships, very little detail on the actual content and relationships for distribution was included. Clearly the applicant has the relationships and knowledge to make the project successful, but a better understanding of the direction of content, promotion and distribution would have strengthened the overall application.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

- Rating: 4

The milestone chart and schedule, as noted about, seem achievable. The financial plan realistically lays out the costs. The procedures for review of the project as it develops are very good.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

- Rating: 4

The management plan is limited to the production of videos and podcasts for the first year. What will be the milestones for years 2 and 3? This reviewer didn't note any financial plan or communications plan. Is it adequate to measure the success of this project by the production of podcasts and videos and mini docs? What about the value to the industry of these pieces? How will that be measured?

- Reviewer: G-47-01C

- Rating: 2

The milestones and deliverables outlined for year one extend to years two and three. In terms of the financial plan, the project includes \$270,000 for editorial management, which includes oversight of the overall project, research, interviews, content creation, and publication and distribution through various avenues, including but not limited to online platforms (website

and social media), newsletters, the Talking Trails App. Filming and production of a minimum of 36 videos throughout the project's duration is expected to cost no more than \$292,000. Marketing (Talking Points app, digital advertising, newsletter subscription) and incidentals (photo rights, music, etc.) will cost approximately \$40,000 total. The communications plan, as outlined in the review item #4 regarding methodology, will include at least one post a week throughout the project online and via social media. Partnerships with area museums must still be developed, but there is interest among potential partners as noted in the grant application. Many of the online tools for distribution are extremely cost-efficient and require just a monthly subscription to a newsletter service and small amounts of money (\$100 to reach approximately 60,000 people) to promote online. In addition, analytical tools through these online platforms allow us to determine the demographics of the audience that is viewing content and what content most interests them to help guide future content creation in the future. The value to the industry may be summed up by Rudyard Kipling who said "If history were taught in the form of stories, it would never be forgotten." Today, the contributions and achievements by the industry and the positive impacts they have had on many North Dakotans, whether they were workers who found a second chance in the oilfields or the rural communities that were on the verge of dying, are overshadowed by the opposition who would rather see and keep the industry painted in a negative light. To date, this has too often been the case, which is unfortunate. Our industry and its pioneers have tremendous stories to tell of triumph, failure, and perseverance, all of which may serve to educate others and create a respect for the industry and those who built it. If we want future generations to know and remember this momentous point in our state's history and perhaps even become inspired by it, these stories must be recorded and preserved, if only for posterity's sake.

- Applicant

7. The proposed purchase of equipment and the facilities available is:

Based on the outlined methods for capture and delivery of the project, the proposed budget is well aligned.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

- Rating: 3

There is little in this proposal relating to facilities or purchase of equipment. Most of the expense is for personnel and services.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

- Rating: 4

None were noted. It is assumed none are needed and that the production work for the project is going to be bid out to a vendor.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C

- Rating: 3

No equipment should have to be purchased with the exception of a decent microphone and/or recording device, which the principal investigator is willing to provide at her own expense.

The project will entail other incidentals, such as photo or video rights. Other equipment, such as cameras will be provided by the vendor.

- Applicant

8. The proposed budget "value"¹ relative to the outlined work and the commitment from other sources is of:

Overall, the effort capture and document the achievements of the industry will provide value long term. The applicants commitment to not only using the material for their own good, but sharing broadly the content and materials will give the project long-life and impacts, creating good value and return for the industry.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A
- Rating: 3

The ND Petroleum Council is committing a considerable amount of money, and the work of some key personnel, to the completion of the project.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B
- Rating: 4

The line item for videographer should provide a very high-quality end product. This reviewer questions the line item amounts available for marketing and did not see a breakdown for editorial management. For example, if produced videos of pioneers in the industry aren't viewed by the target audiences as hoped, are there dollars available to sponsor social media posts and pay for placement of videos?

- Reviewer: G-47-01C
- Rating: 4

The budget for marketing expenses includes \$17,400 for the Talking Points app, approximately \$10,000 for website development with the remainder available for incidentals and paid digital ads. Digital advertising is extremely cost-effective, primarily because it does allow the targeting of specific audiences.

- Applicant

9. The “financial commitment”² from other sources in terms of “match funding” have been identified:

The commitments are noted but not much detail on a plan of approach to gain funding. The applicant would clearly have the relationships needed, it simply would have been nice to understand the timeframe for revenue attraction and overall goals for commitments.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A
- Rating: 3

The ND Petroleum Council is committing to fund more than half of the costs. I believe they see the value of this research project and are willing to commit considerable resources to it.

- Reviewer: G-47-01B
- Rating: 4

There is the suggestion contributions from industry partners will be sought through the North Dakota Petroleum Foundation.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C
- Rating: 4

The timeframe for attracting additional partners is largely dependent upon the approval of this project, as well as the final organization of the North Dakota Petroleum Foundation. Before seeking industry partnerships, the principal investigator would like to have (and would likely need) some pieces produced to share as examples before those partners would be willing to commit funds. Unfortunately, these timelines are still too tentative to provide a more definite plan for attracting additional partners.

- Applicant

1 “value” – The value of the projected work and technical outcome for the budgeted amount of the project, based on your estimate of what the work might cost in research settings with which you are familiar. A commitment of support from industry partners equates to a higher value.

2 “financial commitment” from other sources – A minimum of 50% of the total project must come from other sources to meet the program guidelines. Support less than 50% from Industrial Commission sources should be evaluated as favorable to the application; industry partnerships equates to increased favorability.

General Comments

The project is well suited to meet its overall goals and those of the Council in the area of education and knowledge. The plan to distribute the information through multiple channels and partners creates long-term value for the investment, along with the historical significance. While greater detail about some portions of the plan would have strengthened the application, the overall purpose and mission are well-defined. The effort should show returns in changing perceptions and enticing future workforce to consider a career path in the oil and gas industry. I recommend funding the program.

- Reviewer: G-47-01A

I have sent a separate letter to the OGRC concerning the merits of this project. The proposal to focus on interviews of people involved in the development of this industry in North Dakota is very significant--these kinds of first person sources can be very valuable to later researchers. Also, the proposal has built in specifications for review. Finally, the results of this research will be made available to state and regional historical agencies, which will insure it is available for use by future researchers..

- Reviewer: G-47-01B

It is always the most difficult and risky however, this reviewer would like to see some goals attached to changes in behavior. For example, more students entering oil and gas-related programs at the college level, or more applications for open positions in the North Dakota oil and gas industry. Perhaps it might start with a target number of educators who begin using the created videos and podcasts as part of their North Dakota curriculum. This reviewer fully supports the idea of documenting the history of the oil and gas industry for future generations. Storytelling is one of the most engaging ways to do this. Making use of online platforms and mobile apps connect with a broader base of stakeholders.

- Reviewer: G-47-01C