

# Technical Reviewers' Rating Summary

Proposal Number **G-028-01** Application Title **Public-Private Partnership** Submitted By  
**University of North Dakota** Request For **\$4,000,000.00** Total Project Costs  
**\$14,000,000.00**

## Section A. Scoring

Statement	Weighting Factor	G-028-01A	G-028-01B	G-028-01C	Average Weighted Score
1. Objectives	9	4	4	5	36
2. Achievability	7	5	5	3	28
3. Methodology	8	4	5	3	32
4. Contribution	8	4	4	4	32
5. Awareness / Background	5	3	4	2	15
6. Project Management	3	3	4	3	9
7. Equipment / Facilities	2	4	5	3	8
8. Value / Industry - Budget	4	5	5	5	20
9. Financial Match - Budget	4	5	5	5	20
<b>Average Weighted Score</b>		<b>207</b>	<b>225</b>	<b>187</b>	<b>206</b>
	Total: 50				<b>250 possible points</b>

## OVERALL RECOMMENDATION

FUND **X** **X** **X**  
 FUNDING TO BE  
 CONSIDERED  
 DO NOT FUND

## Section B. Ratings and Comments

- The objectives or goals of the proposed project with respect to clarity and consistency with North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals are:

The intent is made quite clear to strengthen G & GE faculty, lab equipment, and W. M. Laird Core Library to attract high quality students and offer them a high caliber geology and engineering education, opportunity for research, scholarships, and research assistance, so these people can go out into the profession and contribute to the well-being of ND, the US, and the world by developing methods to improve oil and gas reserves and other related

resources.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 4

The goals and objectives of this funding proposal are in line with the ND Industrial Commission and Oil and Gas Research Council's goals. They are very clear.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 4

The project is not only consistent with Council goals, but I believe the precedence for establishing such programs exists.

- Reviewer: G-028-01C

- Rating: 5

2. With the approach suggested and time and budget available, the objectives are:

Proposed funding from Harold Hamm, CLR, and NDOGRC would certainly be achievable to provide endowed faculty positions, equipment, etc. to attract first rate students. Although specific research projects are not enumerated, the insinuation here is that if all this was available, the students would come, they would be well educated in G & GE, they could do research, and find professions which could contribute to the well being of the state, nation, and human kind in general.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 5

The goals of this private-public project are certainly achievable.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 5

The short term objectives, those for which the funds are being requested are certainly achievable. The success of the program long term are dependent on a number of factors which I will address in closing.

- Reviewer: G-028-01C

- Rating: 3

3. The quality of the methodology displayed in the proposal is:

The methodology here is not that complicated. Basically with private funds of \$10,000,000, plus \$4,000,000 from the NDOGRC dedicated to endowed G & GE faculty, research funding, and equipment funding to do the research, and with fore sight and proper supervision and monitoring, this should all work.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 4

The proposal shows an excellent approach and methodology.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 5

No comment

- Reviewer: G-028-01C

- Rating: 3

4. The scientific and/or technical contribution of the proposed work to specifically address North Dakota Industrial Commission/Oil and Gas Research Council goals will likely be:

Although no specific research projects are herein mentioned, this application simply would train, and provide exceptional geologists and engineers research opportunities which will be beneficial to ND's well being, and beyond.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 4

The scientific aspects of this funding will definitely meet the Industrial Commission's goals.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 4

If long and short term goals are met.

- Reviewer: G-028-01C

- Rating: 4

5. The background of the principal investigator and the awareness of current research activity and published literature as evidenced by literature referenced and its interpretation and by the reference to unpublished research related to the proposal is:

Dr. El-Rewini appears to have the background, research expertise, planning, and management skills to accomplish the purpose of this application, along with other members of the Department Faculty.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 3

The principal investigator has the academic and scientific background to complete this public-private partnership.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 4

No references included. Members of the faculty/staff team, while well published and experts in their fields have limited oil petroleum/fields experience. I cannot address the research staff from the information provided. I assume they are excellent as are the credentials for all involved in the project. While this rating is low and may be considered negative, the strength in the program is in the future, which has the potential of being better than average of exceptional.

- Reviewer: G-028-01C

- Rating: 2

6. The project management plan, including a well-defined milestone chart, schedule, financial plan, and plan for communications among the investigators and subcontractors, if any, is:

Finance plan is well planned out and straight forward, however communications and determination of success for the program is not well spelled out.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 3

The project management plan is good, slightly aggressive, but obtainable in light of the stated goals.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 4

No comment

- Reviewer: G-028-01C

- Rating: 3

7. The proposed purchase of equipment and the facilities available is:

In order to properly teach, do research, and attract first class faculty and students, well equipped labs, computer programs, and funding are very important and this seems well expressed and justified.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 4

It will be cost effective to have the technical work done on campus instead of by outside vendors. I think with proper training, the equipment purchases are well justified.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 5

No comment

- Reviewer: G-028-01C

- Rating: 3

8. The proposed budget "value" relative to the outlined work and the commitment from other sources is of:

\$10,000,000.00 in private fund donations is what makes this application work. Knowing Mr. Hamm, if this program is successful and brings new life and ideas into oil and gas exploration and development in ND, Mr. Hamm may invest more into the program....who knows.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

- Rating: 5

The State of North Dakota will achieve great value from this combined public-private partnership. Scientific data will be used to enhance oil and natural gas production within the State, and in the process students will be educated for private and public sector jobs.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

- Rating: 5

No comment

- Reviewer: G-028-01C
- Rating: 5

9. The “financial commitment”<sup>2</sup> from other sources in terms of “match funding” have been identified:

Mr. Hamm has been more than generous to the state of ND (Heritage Center donation, charities, etc) and he deserves high accolades for giving back and appreciating what ND has given him and his company, CLR.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A
- Rating: 5

The funding schedule is clear and matching funds from both the private contributor and the Industrial Commission appear to be realistic.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B
- Rating: 5

The potential for further outside contributions is unlimited.

- Reviewer: G-028-01C
- Rating: 5

1 “value” – The value of the projected work and technical outcome for the budgeted amount of the project, based on your estimate of what the work might cost in research settings with which you are familiar. A commitment of support from industry partners equates to a higher value.

2 “financial commitment” from other sources – A minimum of 50% of the total project must come from other sources to meet the program guidelines. Support less than 50% from Industrial Commission sources should be evaluated as favorable to the application; industry partnerships equates to increased favorability.

## General Comments

It has been my observation that many of our earth science institutions with endowed faculty positions, well funded research programs, well funded scholarship programs, connections, and partnerships with private companies and industry, seem to do very well in putting out highly trained geology and engineering graduates. I think this is an excellent opportunity to vastly improve G & GE at UND, thanks to the immense generosity of Harold Hamm. I would highly recommend that the NDOGRC match the funds as per the application, and I do so without any reservations.

- Reviewer: G-028-01A

This is a great project for the University. Besides establishing a means for funding professors and students, the funds will be used to enhance the school’s technological base. Student will be trained in the art of petroleum exploration and exploitation. Additionally, data obtained from thesis and senior papers will aid in understanding the habitat of oil and gas in the State. I highly recommend funding for this project.

- Reviewer: G-028-01B

This is an excellent opportunity for the State and I strongly recommend that it be funded. The short term goals are easily accomplished. But for the longer the success of a program will depend on: -

accreditation of the program in a timely fashion. -the addition of the correct staff to compliment existing personnel. It will be important that new staff not only be focused on research but excel in teaching and most importantly mentoring students. -attracting and graduating students that are not only competent, but love their profession and are capable of independent thinking and learning.  
- Reviewer: G-028-01C